

August 5, 2009

Because of the fragility of the ivory-disked handle, I did not advocate shipping the cue to my office for a physical inspection. Should I have the opportunity to inspect the cue in person, I reserve the right to amend my notes herein. I am basing my observations solely on the dozens of high-resolution pictures sent to me as well as discussions about the cue.

General Cue Stick Description

Harvey Martin custom-made cue with a maple forearm, segmented ivory handle, decorative rings, and an ivory joint and butt cap. The cue has one maple shaft.

Detailed Description of Cue Sections

Joint Screw - Needs to be personally inspected to determine metal and thread size. Screw has a "center" hole. Screw appears to be in near-mint condition.

Main Joint - Ivory, flat-faced. No visible cracks, in near-mint-to-mint condition. The shaft-side joint assembly is a brown fibrous material consistent with Harvey Martin's work. The shaft-side joint appears to be in near-mint condition.

Forearm - Maple, no visible cracks, in excellent to near-mint condition.

Rings - Seven rings separate the handle from the forearm. From the forearm to the handle the rings are colored: red, green, natural, red, natural, green, and red.

Handle - Nine pieces of ivory, stacked, without rings. None of the ivory segments are cracked. Ivory segments are highly figured, milky white in color, and all in excellent to near-mint condition. It is likely that the ivory segments were made from retired billiard balls.

Rings - Seven rings separate the handle from the butt sleeve. From the handle to the butt sleeve the rings are colored: red, green, natural, red, natural, green, and red. These rings are stamped with the following: J·M·C·F·

Butt Sleeve - The maple butt sleeve has the following inscribed in calligraphic, hand-written text: Jim McFarlane. The text needs to be personally examined to determine the medium used to write the letters.

Rings - Seven rings separate the butt sleeve from the butt cap. From the handle to the butt sleeve the rings are colored: red, green, natural, red, natural, green, and red. These rings are stamped with the following: 10·20·70·MARTIN·CUE·L·A·CAL·

Butt Cap - Butt cap is highly figured ivory, milky white in color, with no visible cracks. Butt cap is beveled at the bottom leading to a subtle rubber bumper. Butt cap appears to be in excellent, to near-mint condition.

Finish - Finish appears to be original with the appropriate patina and only very minor chipping. Finish appears to be the appropriate thickness and exhibits a nice patina. Overall, finish appears to be in excellent to near-mint condition.

Butt Section - The butt of the cue disassembles into three sections: forearm, handle, and butt section. The secondary joint screws protruding from each side of the handle section need to be personally inspected to determine the metal used and thread size.

Handle Joints - The joints connecting the handle to the forearm and butt section are piloted. The pilots appear to be tapered and chamfered. Visible when the butt is disassembled are dowel-like inserts indexed every 90° on the joint connecting the handle to the forearm, and every 120° on the joint connecting the handle with the butt sleeve. These need to be inspected to determine if they are dowels to keep the rings more stable, or decorative inlays. Stamped into the face of the joint connecting the handle with the butt sleeve is: J·M·C·F·

Shaft - There is one maple shaft. On the face of the shaft, the following is stamped: J·M·C·F·2. This suggests to me that this was the second shaft. If so, the first shaft is missing. It is possible that the number two signifies something else. The tip and ferrule are well used and exhibit surface scratching and other signs of use. The shaft has not been inspected for straightness. Overall, the shaft appears to be in excellent condition.

Cue Stick Measurements - *measurements taken by William Picard and reported to me.

Cue length - 56 ½" measured from the top of the ferrule, to the bottom of the butt cap just before the rubber.

Cue Weight - 20.4oz

Shaft length - 28 15/16"

Ferrule - 12mm

Joint - 21mm measured at bottom of joint collar on shaft.

Ivory joint - 21mm

Forearm - 11 ½"

Ivory handle - 11 3/8"

Ivory disks - 1st Ivory piece closest to forearm 28.5mm 9th Ivory piece closest to Butt cap 31.5mm

Butt Sleeve - 3 15/16"

Butt cap - 33mm

Other Important Information

Provenance - Cue stick was made for and owned by Jim McFarlane, who was a prominent west-coast 3-cushion billiards player. McFarlane's notable career pinnacled with a second-place finish in the 1976 National 3-Cushion Championship, held in San Jose, California.¹

George Ashby, 8-time National 3-Cushion Champion was interviewed by phone by me, in July of 2009, with regard to this cue stick. Ashby, who was friendly with McFarlane, confirmed that he remembered McFarlane showing him this particular cue at the 1976 National Championship. Mr. Ashby recalls Mr. McFarlane using the cue in that tournament. He further recalls fellow players admiring the cue stick after the conclusion of the event. Mr. Ashby has offered to write a letter detailing his memories about Mr. McFarlane and this cue, though it is not present at the time of this evaluation. Mr. Ashby also mentioned that he would search through his records to see if he could find any pictures of McFarlane with the cue. Should Mr. Ashby submit a letter or find anything of note, I will amend this letter. The cue stick has been in the possession of Sheryl McFarlane, Jim McFarlane's daughter, since his death.

On May 18th, 2009, Sheryl McFarlane sold the cue stick to William Picard for a sum of money not disclosed in this evaluation. The sale is evidenced by a "bill of sale," between the parties, and attached as Exhibit A.

Cue Notes - It was commonly believed that Harvey Martin produced only eight cues featuring ivory-disked handles. Of those eight, only one was thought of to have disassembled the same way this cue does. That cue was made for Allen Gilbert, a National 3-Cushion Champion and friend of Harvey Martin.

The discovery of this cue means that notes should be dispatched to Victor Stein of the Billiards Encyclopedia as well as the Blue Book of Pool Cues, to inform them of this cue and request that future editions of their publications be updated.

Valuation Report

The following valuation is based on the following assumptions: cue is 100% original², there are no visible cracks in any of the ivory parts of the cue, the cue is relatively straight, the cue parts screw together solidly, there are no loose parts, and the pictures from which I have studied this cue have not been altered in such a way to hide or misrepresent the cue in any way.

Rarity - Ivory-handled Harvey Martin cues are rare. Ivory-handled Martin cues that were made for notable players are limited to two known pieces - Allen Gilbert's and Jim McFarlane's. Both cues are similar and there are no other known cues like them. I consider this particular cue to be incredibly rare and believe it is unlikely another will ever be discovered.

Condition - Most ivory-handled Harvey Martin cues have serious imperfections or damage, such as cracked ivory disks in the handle section. What makes this particular cue so impressive is the overall condition. Based on the dozens of high-resolution pictures, this cue appears to be in excellent to near-mint condition.

Value - I suggest the cue be insured for a value of \$42,000 to \$45,000. The cue is a one-of-a-kind and it is irreplaceable.

Justification - Several factors were considered for my valuation of this cue:

- Past private sales of ivory-handled Harvey Martin cues.
- A premium for the condition of the cue, which is the nicest Harvey Martin example I have ever examined.
- A premium for the rarity and desirability of this cue to collectors.
- A premium for the cue belonging to a player of note.
- A premium for documented provenance.

Variables - All collectibles are subject to conditions that affect their value. I believe the following affect the value of this particular cue:

- **Condition of the ivory** - if any of the ivory on the cue were to crack, it would negatively impact the value of the cue. The current condition of the cue, with an emphasis on the ivory handle, joint, and butt, is a large contributing factor to the value.
- **Originality** - should evidence surface that the cue is somehow not original, meaning restored or refinished in any way, it would have a negative impact on the value.
- **Economics and Market Conditions** - The economy and cue collecting trends can positively and negatively impact the value of any cue.

In closing, by accepting this letter, you acknowledge that you have sought my opinion on the value of your cue. You further acknowledge that I make absolutely no guarantee of a sale of your cue, or of the value of the cue. This letter is strictly my opinion based solely on the pictures that you have sent me via email. You acknowledge that if this letter is made public, that I may freely discuss any portion of this letter with anyone. Finally, you acknowledge that should I ever be in the presence of this cue, that I reserve the right to amend or modify my notes herein, based on my observations.

I acknowledge that I have absolutely no financial interest in this cue, or in the sale thereof. I suggest you contact me for a free re-evaluation every three to five years. Should you ever sell the cue stick, please consider reporting the sale amount and terms for amendment here.

Best regards,

Deno J. Andrews

¹ USBA Web Site 2009. <http://www.usba.net/PastChampions.asp>

² With the exception of the tip and ferrule.